REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES
COURT OF TAX APPEALS
QUEZON CITY

THIRD DIVISION

NEW YORK BAY PHILIPPINES, INC., Petitioner,	CTA CASE NO. 9022
	Members:
-versus-	BAUTISTA, *Chairperson* FABON-VICTORINO, *and* RINGPIS-LIBAN, *JJ.*
COMMISSIONER OF INTERNAL REVENUE, Respondent.	Promulgated: MAR 26 2018 4:30 p.m.

x- -x

DECISION

***Fabon-Victorino, J.*:**

This Petition for Review[1] filed by New York Bay Philippines, Inc. on March 31, 2015, prays for the refund or issuance of a tax credit certificate (TCC) in the amount Thirty-One Million Two Hundred Thirty-Two Thousand Three Hundred Ninety-Nine Pesos and Fifty-Two Centavos (₱31,232,399.52), representing its excess and unutilized input value-added tax (VAT) on purchases of goods and services attributable to its zero-rated sales for the year 2013.

Petitioner New York Bay Philippines, Inc. is a domestic corporation with principal place of business at Unit 2102, 21st Floor Antel Global Corporate Center, Julia Vargas Avenue, Pasig City.[2] It is registered with the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC), and is engaged in financial holding activities, specifically, as a remittance service provider, either through electronic bank transfers, door-to-

---

[1] Docket, vol. 1, pp. 10-21.
[2] Par. 1, Petition for Review, docket, vol. 1, pp. 10-11.

door, and other kinds of fund transfer.[3] Petitioner is a VAT registered taxpayer of Revenue District Office (RDO) No. 43A, Bureau of Internal Revenue (BIR) with Taxpayer Identification No. (TIN) 000-217-994-000, as indicated in its Certificate of Registration No. 3RC0000682520.[4]

On the other hand, respondent is the Commissioner of Internal Revenue (CIR), who has the power to decide disputed assessments, refunds of internal revenue taxes, fees or other charges, penalties imposed in relation thereto or other matters arising under the National Internal Revenue Code (NIRC), or other laws or portions thereof administered by the BIR. He holds office at 5th Floor, BIR National Office Building, Agham Road, Diliman, Quezon City.

During the four quarters of calendar year (CY) 2013, petitioner allegedly rendered services in the Philippines to non-resident foreign corporations not engaged in business in the country, the consideration for which were paid in acceptable foreign currency and accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of *Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas* (BSP).[5]

Petitioner accumulated input VAT credits on its domestic purchases of goods and services attributable to its zero-rated sales of services for the four quarters of CY 2013 amounting to ₱31,232,399.52.[6]

Subsequently, petitioner filed an administrative claim for refund/ issuance of a tax credit certificate with the BIR RDO No. 43A, of its alleged excess and unutilized input VAT for the four quarters of CY 2013 in the total amount of ₱31,232,399.52.[7]

---

[3] Exhibit "P-1", docket, vol. 2, pp. 945-958, also Judicial Affidavit dated August 25, 2015, docket volume 1 p. 214.
[4] Exhibit "P-2", docket, vol. 3, p. 959 .
[5] Par. 5, Petition for Review, docket, vol. 1, p. 12.
[6] Pars. 10-11, Petition for Review, docket, vol. 1, pp. 13-14.
[7] Par. 3, Stipulation of Facts, Joint Stipulation of Facts and Issues (JSFI), docket, vol. 1, pp. 232-233.

Due to respondent's inaction to the said administrative claim for refund,[8] petitioner filed the instant Petition for Review before this Court on March 31, 2015.

In his Answer[9] filed on May 21, 2015, respondent registered its opposition to petitioner's judicial action for refund/TCC on account of failure to substantiate its claim and to comply with all the requisites for entitlement thereto under the NIRC of 1997, relevant regulations, and jurisprudence.

On October 12, 2015, a Pre-Trial Order was issued terminating the Pre-Trial Conference[10].

Trial ensued during which petitioner presented as witnesses its Assistant Head of Accounting Ma. Victoria Cruz, and the Court-commissioned Independent Certified Public Accountant (ICPA) Madonna Mia S. Dayego.

Witness **Ma. Victoria Cruz** testified[11] that she oversees the entire accounting operations of petitioner, including tax compliance, filing of returns, and dealing with the BIR and external auditors, consultants and counsel of petitioner. She is also the custodian of petitioner's documents in relation to her functions.

Petitioner is engaged in financial holding activities particularly providing remittance services. It is a VAT-registered taxpayer as of January 1, 1997 with TIN 000-217-994-000.

For the CY 2013, petitioner's sales consisting of local sales subjected to 12% VAT and zero-rated sales amounted to ₱409,451,230.96, for which petitioner paid output VAT on its VAT-able sales in the total amount of ₱8,055.22.

---

[8] Par. 4, Stipulation of Facts, JSFI, docket, vol. 1, p. 233.
[9] Docket, vol. 1, pp. 72-75.
[10] Docket, vol. 1, pp. 246-253.
[11] See Exhibit P-19, Judicial Affidavit dated August 25, 2015, docket volume 1 pp. 213-226; no cross examination, see TSN dated December 1, 2015 p. 22.

As a remittance service provider, which renders services to non-resident clients who are not engaged in business in the Philippines, petitioner incurred input VAT on its domestic purchases of goods and services for the CY 2013 in the amount of ₱31,232,399.52. Petitioner did not carry over and/or apply its excess VAT credits for the TY 2013 against any output VAT for the succeeding periods.

In support thereof, the witness presented petitioner's VAT Returns filed and paid through the BIR's Electronic Filing and Payment System (EFPS) for which a Filing Reference Number was provided.

On November 7, 2014, petitioner filed an administrative claim for refund of its excess and unutilized input VAT for the CY 2013 with the BIR RDO No. 43A, with a Sworn Certification of submission of complete documents to substantiate its claim. Respondent however failed to act on the said claim for refund prompting petitioner to elevate the matter to this Court on March 31, 2015.

The Court-commissioned **ICPA Madonna Mia S. Dayego** declared[12] that she audited the supporting documents pertinent to petitioner's claim for refund of excess and unutilized input VAT on purchases of goods and services attributable to zero-rated sales for CY 2013.

Per her ICPA Report submitted to the Court, petitioner's zero-rated sales for CY 2013 were properly reported in its quarterly VAT Returns and traceable in its General Ledger (GL) and Audited Financial Statements (AFS). Documents also revealed that the payments to petitioner for the zero-rated sales were remitted to its bank accounts which inward remittances were adequately supported by pertinent documents.

Petitioner's VATable sales were also reported in its quarterly VAT Returns, GL, and AFS, and adequately

---

[12] See Judicial Affidavit dated February 3, 2016, docket volume 2 pp. 867-886; no cross examination, see TSN dated February 9, 2016 p. 8.

✓

supported by VAT ORs. This is also true with regard to petitioner's input taxes, including the input taxes on capital goods not exceeding ₱1M, and the input taxes on domestic purchases of services and goods other than capital goods.

Finally, her audit showed that the total input taxes for CY 2013 were not applied against any output VAT liability for the same year.

Thus, out of the ₱31,232,399.52 being claimed for refund by petitioner, the substantiated amount of ₱30,959,767.63 may be refunded as excess unutilized input VAT on purchases of goods and services.

Petitioner rested after all of its formally offered exhibits were admitted by the Court in the Resolution[13] dated May 2, 2016.

On February 7, 2017, respondent's counsel manifested that he would no longer present any evidence for respondent.[14]

The case was submitted for decision on April 3, 2017.[15]

THE ISSUE

The parties submitted the following issue for the Court's resolution:

> Whether petitioner is entitled to its claim for refund/TCC for the amount of ₱31,232,399.52, representing its excess and unutilized input VAT for the four quarters of CY 2013. [16]

---

[13] Docket, vol. 3, pp. 1043-1044.
[14] Docket, vol. 3, p. 1065.
[15] Docket, vol. 3, p. 1113.
[16] Stipulated Issue for Resolution, JSFI, docket, vol. 1, p. 233.

DISCUSSION/RULING

Section 112(A) and (C) of the National Internal Revenue Code of 1997, as amended, pertinently provides:

> SEC. 112. *Refunds or Tax Credits of Input Tax.* –
>
> (A) *Zero-Rated or Effectively Zero-Rated Sales.* – Any VAT-registered person, whose sales are zero-rated or effectively zero-rated may, within two (2) years after the close of the taxable quarter when the sales were made, apply for the issuance of a tax credit certificate or refund of creditable input tax due or paid attributable to such sales, except transitional input tax, to the extent that such input tax has not been applied against output tax: *Provided, however,* That in the case of zero-rated sales under Section 106(A)(2)(a)(1), (2) and (b) and Section 108(B)(1) and (2), the acceptable foreign currency exchange proceeds thereof had been duly accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of the Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas (BSP): *Provided, further,* That where the taxpayer is engaged in zero-rated or effectively zero-rated sale and also in taxable or exempt sale of goods of properties or services, and the amount of creditable input tax due or paid cannot be directly and entirely attributed to any one of the transactions, it shall be allocated proportionately on the basis of the volume of sales: *Provided, finally,* That for a person making sales that are zero-rated under Section 108(B)(6), the input taxes shall be allocated ratably between his zero-rated and non-zero-rated sales.
>
> xxx xxx xxx
>
> (C) *Period within which Refund or Tax Credit of Input Taxes shall be Made.* – In proper cases, the Commissioner shall grant a refund or issue the tax credit certificate for creditable input taxes within one hundred twenty (120) days from the date of submission of complete documents in support of the application filed in accordance with Subsection (A) hereof.
>
> In case of full or partial denial of the claim for tax refund or tax credit, or the failure on the part of the Commissioner to act on the application within the period prescribed above, the taxpayer affected may, within thirty (30) days from the receipt of the decision denying the claim or after the expiration of the one hundred twenty

day-period, appeal the decision or the unacted claim with the Court of Tax Appeals."

Thus, to be entitled to refund/TCC of input tax due or paid attributable to zero-rated or effectively zero-rated sales, the following requisites must be satisfied:

1. the taxpayer is VAT-registered;
2. the claim was filed within the prescriptive periods, both in the administrative and judicial levels;
3. the taxpayer is engaged in zero-rated or effectively zero-rated sales;
4. the input taxes were incurred or paid;
5. the input taxes claimed are attributable to zero-rated or effectively zero-rated sales; and
6. the input taxes have not been applied against any output VAT liability.

Petitioner is a VAT-registered taxpayer.

Petitioner's Certificate of Registration No. 3RC0000682520 with Tax Identification No. 000-217-994-000 sufficiently established that it is a duly registered VAT taxpayer[17].

Petitioner's administrative and judicial claims were seasonably filed.

The second requisite was likewise satisfied. Pursuant to Section 112(A) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, petitioner had two (2) years to file a claim for refund/TCC of input VAT attributable to zero-rated or effectively zero-rated sales reckoned from the close of the taxable quarter when the relevant sales were made. Shown below are the dates

---

[17] Docket, vol. 2, p. 959

of the last day of the two-year period for petitioner to file its administrative claim for the four taxable quarters of CY 2013:

PERIOD COVERED	LAST DAY OF THE TWO-YEAR PRESCRIPTIVE PERIOD
January to March 2013 (1st Quarter)	March 31, 2015
April to June 2013 (2nd Quarter)	June 30, 2015
July to September 2013 (3rd Quarter)	September 30, 2015
October to December 2013 (4th Quarter)	December 31, 2015

Evidently, petitioner's administrative claim[18] was timely filed on November 7, 2014, or well within the two-year prescriptive period.

As to the judicial claim, Section 112(C) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, provides that the CIR has one hundred twenty (120) days from the date of submission of the complete documents in support of the application for refund/TCC within which to grant or deny the claim. In case of full or partial denial by the CIR, the taxpayer may file an appeal with this Court within thirty (30) days from receipt of the adverse decision of the CIR. However, if after the 120-day period the CIR fails to act on the application for refund/TCC, the taxpayer may assail such inaction on the part of the CIR to the Court within 30 days.

Significant to the reckoning of the 120-day period is the declaration of the Supreme Court that the application for VAT refund/TCC must be accompanied by complete supporting documents with a statement under oath attesting to the completeness of said supporting documents pursuant to Revenue Memorandum Circular (RMC) No. 54-2014. The affidavit shall also state that these documents are sufficient to support the claim, and no other documents shall be accepted from the taxpayer in order for the CIR to render his decision. The requirement is explicitly mandated by the High Court as follows:

---

[18] Exhibits "P-14" to "P-14-b", docket, vol. 2, pp. 984-988.

As it now stands, RMC 54-2014 dated June 11, 2014 mandates that:

> The application for VAT refund/tax credit **must be accompanied by complete supporting documents** as enumerated in Annex 'A' hereof. In addition, the taxpayer shall attach **a statement under oath** attesting to the completeness of the submitted documents (Annex B). The affidavit shall further state that the said documents are the only documents which the taxpayer will present to support the claim. If the taxpayer is a juridical person, there should be a sworn statement that the officer signing the affidavit (*i.e.*, at the very least, the Chief Financial Officer) has been authorized by the Board of Directors of the company.
>
> Upon submission of the administrative claim and its supporting documents, the claim shall be processed and no other documents shall be accepted/required from the taxpayer in the course of its evaluation. A decision shall be rendered by the Commissioner based only on the documents submitted by the taxpayer. The application for tax refund/tax credit shall be denied where the taxpayer/claimant failed to submit the complete supporting documents. For this purpose, the concerned processing/investigating office shall prepare and issue the corresponding Denial Letter to the taxpayer/claimant.

Thus, under the current rule, the reckoning of the 120-day period has been withdrawn from the taxpayer by RMC 54-2014, since it requires him at the time he files his claim to complete his supporting documents and attest that he will no longer submit any other document to prove his claim. Further, the taxpayer is barred from submitting additional documents after he has filed his administrative claim. [19]

Since RMC No. 54-2014 took effect on June 11, 2014, the same applies to the instant case which administrative claim for refund was filed on November 7, 2014.

---

[19] Pilipinas Total Gas, Inc. vs Commissioner of Internal Revenue, G.R. No. 207112, December 8, 2015.

Thus, the 120-day period shall be reckoned from November 7, 2014 on which date petitioner was already obliged to submit complete supporting documents.

The record shows that petitioner submitted supporting documents per the Checklist of Mandatory Requirements for Claims for VAT Credit/Refund labeled as Annex "A"[20] upon the filing of its administrative claim on November 7, 2014 and executed a Sworn Certification[21] attesting to the completeness of the submitted documents.

Accordingly, respondent had 120 days from November 7, 2014, or until March 9, 2015[22] to decide on petitioner's claim. But as earlier stated, respondent failed to act on the claim within the allowable period of 120 days. Thus, petitioner had 30 days or until April 8, 2015, to appeal such inaction to the Court. Evidently, petitioner's judicial claim for refund/TCC was as well timely filed on March 31, 2015.

Petitioner had zero-rated sales

Regarding the third requisite, petitioner claims that it rendered services in the Philippines to Trans-Fast Remittance LLC and Trans-Fast International FZ-LLC, both non-resident foreign corporations not engaged in business in the Philippines. The consideration for the services rendered were paid for in acceptable foreign currency and accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of the *Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas* (BSP). In view thereof, the services rendered qualify as zero-rated sales under Section 108(B)(2) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, which reads:

> SEC. 108. *Value-added Tax on Sale of Services and Use or Lease of Properties. –*
>
> xxx xxx xxx

---

[20] Docket, vol. 2, p. 987.
[21] Exhibit "P-14-a", docket, vol. 2, p. 986.
[22] March 7, 2015 being a Saturday.

> (B) *Transactions Subject to Zero Percent (0%) Rate.* – The following services performed in the Philippines by VAT-registered persons shall be subject to zero percent (0%) rate:
>
> (1) Processing, manufacturing or repacking goods for other persons doing business outside the Philippines which goods are subsequently exported, where the services are paid for in acceptable foreign currency and accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of the Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas (BSP);
>
> (2) Services other than those mentioned in the preceding paragraph rendered to a person engaged in business conducted outside the Philippines or to a nonresident person not engaged in business who is outside the Philippines when the services are performed, the consideration for which is paid for in acceptable foreign currency and accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of the Bangko Sentral ng Pilipinas (BSP);

In a number of cases, the Supreme Court held that for the supply of services to be VAT zero-rated under Section 108(B)(2) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, the following requisites must be complied with:

1. the services must be other than processing, manufacturing or repacking of goods;

2. the payment for such services must be in acceptable foreign currency accounted for in accordance with the BSP rules and regulations; and

3. the recipient of such services is doing business outside the Philippines. [23]

Again, it was established that petitioner is a remittance service provider conducted either by electronic bank transfers, door-to-door, and other kinds of fund transfer. These services are certainly not in the same category as "processing, manufacturing or repacking of goods".

[23] Commissioner of Internal Revenue vs. Burmeister and Wain Scandinavian Contractor Mindanao, Inc., G.R. No. 153205, January 22, 2007.

Further, petitioner was able to establish that its clients, Trans-Fast Remittance LLC and Trans-Fast International FZ-LLC, are non-resident foreign corporations doing business outside the Philippines through the following documents:

1. SEC Certificate of Non-registration of Company, certifying that Trans-Fast Remittance LLC is not registered as a corporation or partnership in the Philippines;[24]

2. SEC Certificate of Non-registration of Company, certifying that Trans-Fast International FZ-LLC is not registered as a corporation or partnership in the Philippines;[25]

3. Authenticated copy of Trans-Fast Remittance LLC's Articles of Incorporation, License to Transact Business issued by the State of New York, Certificate of Formation from Delaware, and State of Delaware Certificate of Amendment;[26] and

4. Authenticated copy of Trans-Fast International FZ-LLC's Amended Memorandum of Association and Articles of Association.[27]

As to whether the payment for the services rendered by petitioner was in acceptable foreign currency duly accounted for in accordance with the BSP rules, Section 113(A)(2), (B)(1), (2)(c) and (3) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, and as implemented by Sections 4.113-1(A)(2), (B)(1) and (2)(c) of Revenue Regulations (RR) No. 16-05, provide that a VAT taxpayer, like petitioner, shall for every lease of goods or properties and for every sale, barter or exchange of services, issue a VAT official receipt which must contain the following information:

SEC. 113. *Invoicing and Accounting Requirements for VAT-Registered Persons.* –

---

[24] Exhibit "P-15", docket, vol. 2, p. 989.
[25] Exhibit "P-16", docket, vol. 2, p. 990.
[26] Exhibit "P-17", docket, vol. 2, pp. 991-1020.
[27] Exhibit "P-18", docket, vol. 2, pp. 1021-1037.

w/

(A) *Invoicing Requirements.* – A VAT-registered person shall issue:

xxx xxx xxx

(2) A **VAT official receipt** for every lease of goods or properties, and **for every sale, barter or exchange of services**.

(B) *Information Contained in the VAT Invoice or VAT Official Receipt.* – The following information shall be indicated in the VAT invoice or VAT official receipt:

(1) A statement that the seller is a VAT-registered person, followed by his Taxpayer's Identification Number (TIN);

(2) The total amount which the purchaser pays or is obligated to pay to the seller with the indication that such amount includes the value-added tax: *Provided*, that:

xxx xxx xxx

(c) If the sale is subject to zero percent (0%) value-added tax, the term **'zero-rated sale'** shall be written or printed prominently on the invoice or receipt;

xxx xxx xxx

(3) The date of transaction, quantity, unit cost and description of the goods or properties or nature of the service;" *(Emphasis supplied)*

SEC. 4.113-1. *Invoicing Requirements.* –

(A) ***A VAT-registered person shall issue:*** –

xxx xxx xxx

(2) A **VAT official receipt** for every lease of goods or properties, and for every sale, barter or exchange of services.

Only VAT-registered persons are required to print their **TIN followed by the word 'VAT' in their invoice** or official receipts. Said documents shall be considered as a 'VAT Invoice' or VAT official receipt. All purchases covered by invoices/receipts other than VAT Invoice/VAT Official Receipt shall not give rise to any input tax.

> VAT invoice/official receipt shall be prepared at least in duplicate, the original to be given to the buyer and the duplicate to be retained by the seller as part of his accounting records.
>
> (B) ***Information contained in VAT invoice or VAT official receipt.*** - The following information shall be indicated in VAT invoice or VAT official receipt:
>
> (1) A statement that the seller is a VAT-registered person, followed by his TIN;
>
> (2) The total amount which the purchaser pays or is obligated to pay to the seller with the indication that such amount includes the VAT; *Provided*, That:
>
> xxx xxx xxx
>
> (c) If the sale is subject to zero percent (0%) VAT, the term **'zero-rated sale'** shall be written or printed prominently on the invoice or receipt; *(Emphasis supplied)*

To comply with the foregoing provisions, the foreign currency remittances referred to under Section 108(B)(2) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, must be supported by VAT zero-rated official receipts (ORs).

In petitioner's Quarterly VAT Returns for the four quarters of CY 2013, petitioner reported zero-rated sales of ₱409,384,104.16, as shown below:

EXHIBIT	PERIOD COVERED	ZERO-RATED SALES/RECEIPTS
"P-4"	1st Quarter 2013	₱ 91,546,498.51
"P-6"	2nd Quarter 2013	103,399,672.97
"P-8"	3rd Quarter 2013	102,256,361.81
"P-10"	4th Quarter 2013	112,181,570.87
Total		**₱ 409,384,104.16**

To prove that it had rendered services to Trans-Fast Remittance LLC and Trans-Fast International FZ-LLC for the four quarters of CY 2013 and the same were paid for in acceptable foreign currency duly accounted for in accordance with the rules and regulations of the BSP, petitioner presented its VAT zero-rated ORs[28], and various schedules, supported by bank advices, credit advices, credit memoranda, bank certifications, passbooks and bank statements[29], all examined and reviewed by ICPA Madonna Mia S. Dayego.

Verification by the ICPA[30] revealed that petitioner charges the Parent Company (Trans-Fast LLC) and Affiliate Company (Trans-Fast International FZ LLC) on a per transaction rate amounting to USD2.00 to USD2.55 based on the Addenda to the Service Agreement effective January 2012 to July 2013[31].

For the first eight (8) months (*i.e.*, January to August) of CY 2013, petitioner collected the service revenue earned, which was evidenced by OR, by deducting the amount against the funding received for Payment Orders from Parent Company and Affiliate Company. Petitioner implemented the change in procedure in the collection of service revenue for the succeeding months. It collected the service fees for the months of September to December 2013 separately from the funding received for Payment Orders from the Parent and Affiliate Companies.

For the months of September to December 2013, petitioner's sales of services were duly substantiated as can be gleaned from the VAT zero-rated ORs[32] and ICPA's Summary of Comparison of Schedule of Collections of Zero-rated Sales with Bank Advices and Passbooks for September to December 2013[33].

However, for the months of January to August 2013, while the sales of services were supported by VAT zero-rated ORs[34], the ICPA noted unsubstantiated remittances amounting to $13,887,311.08 out of the total funding of $874,716,033.40 and that there was funding by

---

[28] Exhibits "P-28-9" to "P-28-32".
[29] Exhibits "P-29" to "P-39-8".
[30] Exhibit "P-20", ICPA Report, docket, vol. 2, pp. 687-688.
[31] Exhibits "P-59-4" to "P-59-7".
[32] Exhibits "P-28-25" to "P-28-32".
[33] Exhibit "P-39".
[34] Exhibits "P-28-9" to "P-28-24".

International Crew Center S De R L and Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd. without service agreement with the parent or affiliate companies amounting to $172,477.46.[35] The summary of these exceptions is presented hereunder:

	Amount	Exhibit/ Reference
• Unsubstantiated Inward Remittances from Affiliate Company		
No bank advices, credit advices, credit memo or bank certifications	$ 837,583.22	P-36, Note 10.2, p. 48 of 48
Bank certifications with insufficient details	8,564,727.86	P-36, Notes 7 & 8, p. 48 of 48
Remitter was not a Partner	4,485,000.00	P-36, Note 9, p. 48 of 48
Subtotal	*$ 13,887,311.08*	
• Funding Without Service Agreement		
From Parent Company and/or Parent Company's Partners	$ 54,456.00	P-35, Note 3, p. 38 of 38
From Affiliate Company and/or Affiliate Company's Partners	118,021.46	P-36, Note 5, p. 48 of 48
Subtotal	*$ 172,477.46*	
Total Exceptions on funding found by ICPA	**$14,059,788.54**	

Accordingly, the service revenues of ₱19,063.48, related to the transactions consisting the exceptions of $14,059,788.54, shall be denied zero-rating, the details of which are as follows:[36]

	Amount	Reference
• Service revenue from unsubstantiated remittances		
No bank advices, credit advices, credit memo or bank Certifications	₱ 2,285.20	Annex A
Bank certifications with insufficient details - *No remitter name in the bank certification*	12,538.18	Annex B.1
Bank certifications with insufficient details - *Remitter name is "New York Bay Philippines" instead of a Partner*	1,423.31	Annex B.2
Remitter was not a Partner	1,356.69	Annex C
Subtotal	***₱17,603.38***	

[35] Exhibit "P-20", ICPA Report, docket, vol. 2, p. 693.
[36] The amounts were computed on a per transaction basis using the applicable rates per Service Agreements and were converted to peso using the exchange rate used by ICPA per its Schedule of Zero-rated sales.

• Service revenue from funding without service agreement		
From Parent Company and/or Parent Company's Partners	₱521.80	Annex D
From Affiliate Company and/or Affiliate Company's Partners	938.30	Annex E
Subtotal	***₱ 1,460.10***	
Total	**₱19,063.48**	

Hence, out of the ₱409,384,104.16 sales reported by petitioner to have been generated from services rendered to its non-resident affiliates for CY 2013, only the amount of ₱409,365,040.68 (₱409,384,104.16 less ₱19,063.48) qualifies for VAT zero-rating under Section 108(B)(2) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended.

Petitioner incurred and paid input taxes which are attributable to its zero-rated sales

As to the fourth and fifth requisites, in its Quarterly VAT Returns for the four quarters of CY 2013, petitioner reflected input VAT in the total amount of ₱31,232,399.62[37], broken down as follows:

	1st Quarter *(Exhibit P-4)*	**2nd Quarter *(Exhibit P-6)***	**3rd Quarter *(Exhibit P-8)***	**4th Quarter *(Exhibit P-10)***	**Total**
Purchase of Capital Goods not exceeding ₱1M *(Line 21B)*	₱ 7,607.14	₱ 88,322.98	₱ 116,570.36	₱ 54,589.28	₱ 267,089.76
Domestic Purchases of Goods Other than Capital Goods *(Line 21F)*	-	6,058.93	4,892.14	18,982.04	29,933.11
Domestic Purchase of Services *(Line 21J)*	6,778,174.50	7,469,931.93	7,941,686.64	8,745,583.68	30,935,376.75
Total Input Taxes for the period	**₱6,785,781.64**	**₱7,564,313.84**	**₱8,063,149.14**	**₱8,819,155.00**	**₱31,232,399.62**

[37] With a difference of 0.10 compared to the amount of claim due to typographical error on carry over from 3rd Quarter to 4th Quarter VAT Returns.

To prove that it incurred/paid the afore-mentioned input VAT, petitioner submitted various suppliers' invoices[38] and ORs[39]. Upon examination of these documents, the ICPA noted exceptions in the amount of ₱272,631.89, to wit:[40]

Exhibit	Particulars	1st Qtr	2nd Qtr	3rd Qtr	4th Qtr	Total
Input taxes on Capital goods not exceeding ₱1M						
P-54	Supported by original VAT invoices without the TIN of the Petitioner	-	₱ 348.00	₱ 3,375.00	-	₱ 3,723.00
P-50	Not supported	-	23,153.54	-	-	23,153.54
Input taxes on Domestic Purchases of Goods other than Capital Goods						
P-51	Not supported	-	-	-	₱ 728.11	728.11
Input taxes on Domestic Purchases of Services						
P-45	Input VAT not traced to GL/CVs/EDGE Pro Journal Entry Print-outs	-	188.04	-	21.42	209.46
P-48	Input VAT per OR is lower than the amount per claim	-	-	-	176.78	176.78
P-49	Supported by original VAT ORs in the name of the petitioner not dated or issued within the taxable year	-	-	2,842.50	36,072.87	38,915.37
P-53	Supported by original VAT ORs not in the name of the petitioner	₱ 1,448.57	1,011.43	840.00	-	3,300.00
P-55	Supported by original VAT ORs without/invalid TIN of the petitioner	10,144.29	-	-	-	10,144.29
P-57	Supported by non-VAT acknowledgement receipt in the name of the petitioner	-	-	-	2,012.22	2,012.22
P-56	Supported by original VAT ORs without the address of the petitioner	420.00	-	-	6,375.51	6,795.51
P-52	Not supported	48,817.75	89,597.20	44,460.16	598.50	183,473.61
Total Downward Adjustment per ICPA		**₱60,830.61**	**₱114,298.21**	**₱51,517.66**	**₱45,985.41**	**₱272,631.89**

The Court finds the above findings of the ICPA in order. The aforesaid input taxes of ₱272,631.89 shall be disallowed from petitioner's claim as they were not properly substantiated by VAT invoices or ORs as prescribed under Sections 110(A) and 113(A) and (B) of the NIRC of 1997, as amended, and as implemented by Sections 4.110-1, 4.110-

---

[38] Exhibits "P-46-1" to "P-46-20", "P-47-1", to "P-47-15", and "P-54-1" to "P-54-2".
[39] Exhibits "P-48-1" to "P-48-156", "P-49-1" to "P-49-23", "P-53-1" to "P-53-5", "P-55-1" to "P-55-3", "P-56-1" to "P-56-2", and "P-57-1".
[40] Exhibit "P-20", ICPA Report, docket, vol. 2, p. 703.

2, 4.110-8, and 4.113-1(A) and (B) of Revenue Regulations (RR) No. 16-05.

In addition to the disallowance of ₱272,631.89 input VAT, the amount of ₱143,415.73, broken down below, should likewise be disallowed for failure to meet the substantiation requirements under the aforesaid VAT law and regulations, thus:

	Supplier	Invoice/ OR No.	Amount	Exhibit
Input taxes on Capital goods not exceeding ₱1M				
1.	***Supported by VAT invoices w/ATP dated between Jan. 1, 2011 to Jan. 17, 2013 not stamped "valid until October 31, 2013 only" in violation of RMC No. 52-2013***[41]			
	Zenshin Systems Corporation	224617	₱ 7,607.14	P-46-1
	Integrated Computer Systems, Inc.	210066388	5,217.86	P-46-2
	J.P Mactal Enterprises	3399	1,821.43	P-46-3
	J.P Mactal Enterprises	0343	803.57	P-46-10
2.	***Supported by VAT invoice but undated***			
	Safe One Enterprises	8174	1,028.57	P-46-4
	Subtotal		***₱ 16,478.57***	
Input taxes on Domestic Purchases of Goods other than Capital Goods				
3.	***Supported by VAT invoice w/ATP dated between Jan. 1, 2011 to Jan. 17, 2013 not stamped "valid until October 31, 2013 only" in violation of RMC No. 52-2013.***			
	Integrated Computer Systems, Inc.	210066388	₱ 4,339.29	P-46-2
4.	***Supported by VAT invoice with notation "NOT VALID FOR CLAIMING INPUT TAXES"***			
	Intertech Forms Manufacturing Corporation	10063	4,285.71	P-47-2
	Subtotal		***₱ 8,625.00***	
Input taxes on Domestic Purchases of Services				
5.	***Supported by VAT ORs w/ATP dated between Jan. 1, 2011 to Jan. 17, 2013 not stamped "valid until October 31, 2013 only" in violation of RMC No. 52-2013.***			
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1858140A	₱ 210.63	P-48-1
	Bernaldo Directo&PO Law Offices	9293	1,440.00	P-48-3
	Bernaldo Directo&PO Law Offices	9542	1,440.00	P-48-4
	CIS Bayad Center, Inc.	16792	424.29	P-48-8
	CIS Bayad Center, Inc.	17042	1,607.15	P-48-9
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	19985	7,114.97	P-48-10
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	19986	7,114.97	P-48-11
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	19987	7,114.97	P-48-12
	JobsDB. Philippines Inc.	60997	720.00	P-48-16

[41] Clarifying the Validity of Unused/Unissued Principal and Supplementary Receipts/Invoices Printed Prior to January 18, 2013 and other matters

xxx

II. *Receipts with Authority to Print dated January 1, 2011 to January 17, 2013*

All Principal and Supplementary Receipts/Invoices with ATP *dated January 1, 2011 to January 17, 2013* may be used until October 31, 2013 provided that new ATP was issued on or before August 30, 2013. xxx

In all principal and supplementary receipts/invoice which can still be used until October 31, 2013, the term "valid until October 31, 2013 only" shall be stamped prominently on the face of the receipts or invoices (original and duplicate copies). Otherwise, no deduction and input tax may be claimed using these receipts/invoices.

	Philrem Services Corp.	3324	10,130.89	P-48-23
	Philrem Services Corp.	3328	10,399.29	P-48-24
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	89329	216.96	P-48-25
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	89657	216.96	P-48-26
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	89736	216.96	P-48-27
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1878550A	37.65	P-48-30
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1878549A	66.60	P-48-31
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1881614A	16.65	P-48-32
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1881615A	67.32	P-48-33
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1880740A	16.65	P-48-34
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1865045A	65.43	P-48-35
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1885970A	97.56	P-48-36
	Bernaldo Directo&PO Law Offices	9546	1,440.00	P-48-37
	Bernaldo Directo&PO Law Offices	9767	1,440.00	P-48-38
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	19988	7,114.97	P-48-45
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	19989	7,114.97	P-48-46
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	20153	7,470.72	P-48-47
	I.T Citi Services, Inc.	2887	10,530.00	P-48-54
	JobsDB. Philippines Inc.	64633	1,440.00	P-48-56
	Philrem Services Corp.	3386	13,420.71	P-48-63
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	90213	216.96	P-48-64
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	90649	216.96	P-48-65
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	91026	216.96	P-48-66
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1889704A	33.30	P-48-69
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1889705A	93.06	P-48-70
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1889748A	16.65	P-48-71
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1889749A	34.02	P-48-72
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1893948A	46.44	P-48-74
	Airfreight 2100, Inc.	1893947A	43.65	P-48-75
	Bernaldo Directo&PO Law Offices	9844	1,440.00	P-48-80
	Deeconcrete Incorporated	20153	14,941.44	P-48-47
	JobsDB. Philippines Inc.	65491	720.00	P-48-100
	JobsDB. Philippines Inc.	66344	720.00	P-48-101
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	91498	216.96	P-48-111
	Pronto Express Distribution, Inc.	91738	216.96	P-48-112
6.	***Supported by VAT ORs wherein input VAT per OR is lower than amount per claim (overclaim)***			
	Federal Express Pacific Inc. (1,539.42 less 1,511.93)	A00031012	27.49	P-48-50
	ZMG Ward Howell, Inc. (22,464.00 less 22,062.86)	1027	401.14	P-48-68
	Airfreight 2100, Inc. (59.40 less 58.33)	2005462A	1.07	P-48-73
	Airfreight 2100, Inc. (44.28 less 43.49)	2005463A	0.79	P-48-76
	Airfreight 2100, Inc. (41.49 less 40.75)	2007156A	0.74	P-48-77
	Airfreight 2100, Inc. (16.65 less 16.35)	2005479A	0.30	P-48-78
	Subtotal		***₱118,312.16***	
Grand Total			**₱143,415.73**	

Out of petitioner's input VAT claim of ₱31,232,399.52, only the amount of ₱30,816,351.90 represents petitioner's valid input VAT, computed as follows:

Input VAT per petitioner's claim		₱ 31,232,399.52
Disallowances:		
Per ICPA's findings	₱ 272,631.89	

Per Court's further verification	143,415.73	416,047.62
Valid input VAT		**₱30,816,351.90**

However, a portion of the valid input VAT of ₱30,816,351.90 shall be applied against petitioner's total reported output VAT liability of ₱8,055.22[42]. Consequently, only the remaining input VAT of ₱30,808,296.68 can be attributed to the entire zero-rated sales declared by petitioner in the amount of ₱409,384,104.16 and only the input VAT of ₱30,806,862.05 is attributable to the valid zero-rated sales of ₱409,365,040.68, as computed below:

Valid input VAT	₱ 30,816,351.90
Less: Output VAT	8,055.22
Excess Valid Input VAT	**₱ 30,808,296.68**
Divide by Total Declared Zero-Rated Sales	409,384,104.16
Multiply by Valid Zero-Rated Sales	409,365,040.68
Excess Valid Input VAT attributable to Valid Zero-Rated Sales	**₱ 30,806,862.05**

Petitioner's excess input taxes were not applied against any output VAT liability

As to the sixth and last requisite, petitioner's input VAT claim of ₱31,232,399.52 remained unutilized until it was deducted as "VAT Refund/TCC claimed"[43] in its Amended Quarterly VAT Return for the fourth quarter of CY 2013. Further, the same was not reflected as carry-over in petitioner's Monthly and Quarterly VAT returns[44] of the succeeding CY 2014.

WHEREFORE, the instant Petition for Review is hereby **PARTIALLY GRANTED**. Accordingly, respondent is **ORDERED TO REFUND OR TO ISSUE A TAX CREDIT CERTIFICATE** in favor of petitioner in the reduced amount of **₱30,806,862.05**, representing its excess and unutilized

[42] Total of the amounts in Line 19B of Exhibits "P-4", "P-6", "P-8", and "P-10".
[43] Line 23D of Exhibit "P-10", docket, vol. 2, p. 977.
[44] Exhibits "P-58-1" to "P-58-10".

No bank advices, credit advices credit memo or bank certifications (Exhibit P-36, p. 48 of 48, Note 10.2)

				a	b	c = a*b
Date	**Bank**	**Bank Account**	**Amount (in USD)**	***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
01/09/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	84,992.50	2.30	40.7295	93.68
01/15/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	59,992.50	2.30	40.7295	93.68
01/23/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	49,992.50	2.30	40.7295	93.68
01/30/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	59,992.50	2.30	40.7295	93.68
02/06/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	149,992.50	2.30	40.6723	93.55
02/12/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	134,992.50	2.30	40.6723	93.55
02/20/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	74,992.50	2.30	40.6723	93.55
03/01/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	74,992.50	2.30	40.7127	93.64
05/17/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	5,740.72	2.30	41.298	94.99
05/24/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,187.00	2.30	41.298	94.99
05/27/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	8,510.72	2.30	41.298	94.99
05/31/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,875.09	2.30	41.298	94.99
06/03/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	5,036.69	2.30	42.9069	98.69
06/27/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	10,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
07/03/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,863.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
07/05/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,992.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
07/11/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,023.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
07/16/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,749.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
07/18/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,904.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
07/24/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,951.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
08/01/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	1,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
08/06/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,944.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
08/14/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,931.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
08/23/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	10,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
08/29/2013	Banco de Oro	1006-6116-6147	9,936.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
Total			**837,583.22**			**2,285.20**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement: Exh. "P-59-4" - effective Jul. 2011 payments from Middle East =$2.30*
Exh. "P-59-7" - effective Jul. 2013 payments from Middle East =$2.00
**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1255	01/02/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	65,042.04	65,042.04	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/07/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	25,992.45	25,992.45	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	67,351.27	67,351.27	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/09/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	26,813.64	26,813.64	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/10/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	112.00	112.00	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/11/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	15,297.96	15,297.96	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/14/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	59,934.85	59,934.85	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	40,625.21	40,625.21	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/16/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	33,674.75	33,674.75	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/17/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	51,593.81	51,593.81	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	51,185.06	51,185.06	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/21/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	54,605.33	54,605.33	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/23/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	9,664.58	9,664.58	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1255	01/28/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	31,245.13	31,245.13	2.30	40.7295	93.68
P-36-1-1257	02/04/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	93,585.87	93,585.87	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/05/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	62,513.59	62,513.59	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/06/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	27,898.63	27,898.63	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/11/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	48,136.17	48,136.17	2.30	40.6723	93.55

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1257	02/12/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	12,062.70	12,062.70	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/13/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	70,861.18	70,861.18	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	19,043.56	19,043.56	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	70,533.00	70,533.00	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,555.37	16,555.37	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/20/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	20,546.72	20,546.72	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/22/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,825.33	16,825.33	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/25/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	33,126.23	33,126.23	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/27/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	38,517.88	38,517.88	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1257	02/28/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	31,489.80	31,489.80	2.30	40.6723	93.55
P-36-1-1259	03/01/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,263.90	22,263.90	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/04/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,263.90	22,263.90	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/06/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	101,475.09	101,475.09	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/07/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	(5,389.26)	(5,389.26)	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	29,091.80	29,091.80	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/11/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	19,218.74	19,218.74	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/13/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	78,665.91	78,665.91	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/14/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,944.37	16,944.37	2.30	40.7127	93.64

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1259	03/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	10,147.58	10,147.58	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	48,990.49	48,990.49	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,781.06	16,781.06	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/25/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	57,684.98	57,684.98	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/26/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	11,955.51	11,955.51	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1259	03/27/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	49,224.74	49,224.74	2.30	40.7127	93.64
P-36-1-1261	04/01/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	27,098.41	27,098.41	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/02/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	65,564.89	65,564.89	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/03/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	14,785.74	14,785.74	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/05/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	23,531.16	23,531.16	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	41,287.68	41,287.68	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/10/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	63,964.10	63,964.10	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/12/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	39,340.11	39,340.11	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	52,520.13	52,520.13	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/16/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	18,581.74	18,581.74	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/17/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	10,251.62	10,251.62	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,294.19	16,294.19	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,678.22	16,678.22	2.30	41.1422	94.63

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1261	04/22/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	49,359.76	49,359.76	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/23/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	31,855.66	31,855.66	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/24/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	27,515.23	27,515.23	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/25/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,719.39	16,719.39	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/26/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	14,594.65	14,594.65	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/29/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	40,339.39	40,339.39	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1261	04/30/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	5,402.76	5,402.76	2.30	41.1422	94.63
P-36-1-1263	05/02/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	40,585.03	40,585.03	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/03/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	31,742.99	31,742.99	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/06/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	68,901.80	68,901.80	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/07/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	34,590.79	34,590.79	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	20,337.53	20,337.53	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/09/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,601.39	16,601.39	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/10/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,277.33	22,277.33	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/14/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	86,509.14	86,509.14	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	15,825.76	15,825.76	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/16/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	24,826.90	24,826.90	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/17/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	13,888.64	13,888.64	2.30	41.2980	94.99

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1263	05/20/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	48,441.47	48,441.47	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/21/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,159.32	16,159.32	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/22/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,252.79	16,252.79	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/23/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	14,393.37	14,393.37	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/24/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	11,239.32	11,239.32	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/27/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,874.80	22,874.80	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/28/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	28,020.64	28,020.64	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/29/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	21,516.61	21,516.61	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/30/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	21,753.93	21,753.93	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1263	05/31/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	28,396.47	28,396.47	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-1265	06/03/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	67,939.04	67,939.04	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/04/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	8,732.42	8,732.42	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/05/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	44,888.18	44,888.18	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/06/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	25,308.90	25,308.90	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/07/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	(2,794.04)	(2,794.04)	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/10/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	44,380.17	44,380.17	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/11/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	19,630.31	19,630.31	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/13/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	102,742.06	102,742.06	2.30	42.9069	98.69

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1265	06/14/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	27,602.98	27,602.98	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/17/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	56,782.89	56,782.89	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	32,964.84	32,964.84	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	23,625.71	23,625.71	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/20/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	30,857.99	30,857.99	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/21/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	23,230.46	23,230.46	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/24/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	43,609.64	43,609.64	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/25/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,025.40	16,025.40	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1265	06/26/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	15,650.36	15,650.36	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1268	07/01/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	75,005.43	75,005.43	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/02/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	18,093.25	18,093.25	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/04/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	64,577.67	64,577.67	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/05/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	34,995.85	34,995.85	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	78,481.70	78,481.70	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/09/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	30,368.63	30,368.63	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/10/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	28,394.58	28,394.58	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/11/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,423.09	22,423.09	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/12/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	27,521.60	27,521.60	2.00	43.3559	86.71

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1268	07/15/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	49,986.32	49,986.32	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/16/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,965.65	22,965.65	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/17/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	22,783.01	22,783.01	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/18/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	16,419.70	16,419.70	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	18,083.61	18,083.61	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/22/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	34,752.62	34,752.62	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/23/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	18,604.96	18,604.96	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/24/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	9,716.08	9,716.08	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/25/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	37,764.37	37,764.37	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/26/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	10,312.59	10,312.59	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/29/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	28,349.36	28,349.36	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/30/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	44,055.00	44,055.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1268	07/31/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	19,695.98	19,695.98	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1270	08/01/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	38,268.53	38,268.53	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/05/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	126,521.12	126,521.12	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/07/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	76,433.30	76,433.30	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/08/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	91.68	91.68	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/12/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	33,805.41	33,805.41	2.00	43.8629	87.73

Bank certifications with insufficient details -No remitter name in the bank certification (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1270	08/14/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	107,900.35	107,900.35	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/16/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	29,226.92	29,226.92	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/19/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	39,784.48	39,784.48	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/22/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	79,805.67	79,805.67	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/23/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	24,646.79	24,646.79	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/27/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	58,694.15	58,694.15	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/28/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	33,842.54	33,842.54	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/29/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	49,158.16	49,158.16	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1270	08/30/2013	-	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Chinabank	1307051010	97,046.63	97,046.63	2.00	43.8629	87.73
Total						**4,844,727.86**	**4,844,727.86**			**12,538.18**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement: Exh. "P-59-4" - effective Jul. 2011 payments from Middle East =$2.30*
Exh. "P-59-7" - effective Jul. 2013 payments from Middle East =$2.00
**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

Bank certifications with insufficient details -Remitter name is "New York Bay Philippines" instead of a Partner (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1264	06/25/2013	New York Bay Philippines Inc	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.		100661166147	325,000.00	325,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1264	06/27/2013	New York Bay Philippines Inc	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1264	06/28/2013	New York Bay Philippines Inc	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	220,000.00	220,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1267	07/08/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	200,000.00	200,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/09/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	490,000.00	490,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/10/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	190,000.00	190,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/11/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	155,000.00	155,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/12/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/16/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	270,000.00	270,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/17/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/19/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	170,000.00	170,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71

Bank certifications with insufficient details -Remitter name is "New York Bay Philippines" instead of a Partner (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1267	07/23/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	350,000.00	350,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/24/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/26/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	150,000.00	150,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/30/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	600,000.00	600,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/31/2013	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	200,000.00	200,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
Total						**3,720,000.00**	**3,720,000.00**			**1,423.31**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement:* *Exh. "P-59-4" - effective Jul. 2011 payments from Middle East =$2.30*
Exh. "P-59-7" - effective Jul. 2013 payments from Middle East =$2.00

**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

Remitter was not a Partner (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	b	c = a*b
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	Date	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
						Gross	Net			
P-36-1-1264	06/14/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	150,000.00	150,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1264	06/18/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	360,000.00	360,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1264	06/19/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1264	06/21/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	125,000.00	125,000.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1267	07/02/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	850,000.00	850,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/03/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	150,000.00	150,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1267	07/04/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	235,000.00	235,000.00	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1269	08/06/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	875,000.00	875,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/14/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	300,000.00	300,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/16/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	125,000.00	125,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/20/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	305,000.00	305,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73

Remitter was not a Partner (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

								a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Certificate Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
						Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1269	08/22/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	100,000.00	100,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/23/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	110,000.00	110,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/27/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	500,000.00	500,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1269	08/28/2013	Citibank N.a.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	200,000.00	200,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
Total						**4,485,000.00**	**4,485,000.00**			**1,356.69**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement:* *Exh. "P-59-4" - effective Jul. 2011 payments from Middle East =$2.30*
Exh. "P-59-7" - effective Jul. 2013 payments from Middle East =$2.00

**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

Funding from Parent Company and/or Parent Company's Partner without Service Agreement (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-35")

									a	b	c = a*b
Bank Advice Exhibit No.	Date	Transaction / Ref. No.	Remitter Name	Beneficiary Name	Beneficiary Bank	Bank Acct No.	Amount (in USD)		*Rate per transaction (in USD)	*Conversion Rate	Service Income (in PHP)
							Gross	Net			
P-35-1-7	01/03/2013	CORR13010300892	INTERNATIONAL CREW CENTER S DE R L	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100660800039	11,990.00	11,990.00	2.55	40.7295	103.86
P-35-1-8	01/07/2013	CORR13010700550	INTERNATIONAL CREW CENTER S DE R L	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100660800039	13,493.00	13,493.00	2.55	40.7295	103.86
P-35-1-22	01/25/2013	CORR13012501696	INTERNATIONAL CREW CENTER S DE R L	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100660800039	7,990.00	7,990.00	2.55	40.7295	103.86
P-35-1-99	04/17/2013	CORR13041700743	International crew Center S De R L	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100660800039	11,993.00	11,993.00	2.55	41.1422	104.91
P-35-1-132	05/17/2013	CORR13051701330	1/ International Crew Center S DE R	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100660800039	8,990.00	8,990.00	2.55	41.2980	105.31
Total							**54,456.00**	**54,456.00**			**521.80**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement: Exh. "P-59-5" - effective Jan. 2012 payments from USA, Canada, Europe and Israel =$2.55.*
**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

Funding from Affiliate Company and/or Affiliate Company's Partner without Service Agreement (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

									a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Advice Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Transaction / Ref. No.**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
							Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-724	05/14/2013	CORR13051403305	Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	23,466.31	23,466.31	2.30	41.2980	94.99
P-36-1-860	06/06/2013	CORR13060602693	Ving Go Manpower Co..,ltd	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	10,064.41	10,064.41	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-880	06/11/2013	CORR13061103876	Ving Go Manpower Co..,ltd	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	7,116.74	7,116.74	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-908	06/17/2013	CORR13061701548	Ving Go Manpower Co..,ltd	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	10,431.52	10,431.52	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-923	06/19/2013	CORR13061901338	Ving Go Manpower Co..,ltd	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	9,353.51	9,353.51	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-941	06/24/2013	CORR13062402157	Ving Go Manpower Co..,ltd	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	9,300.00	9,300.00	2.30	42.9069	98.69
P-36-1-1009	07/08/2013	CORR13070802275	Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	9,022.76	9,022.76	2.00	43.3559	86.71
P-36-1-1134	08/02/2013	CORR13080203379	Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	8,330.00	8,330.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73
P-36-1-1162	08/12/2013	CORR13081204323	Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	10,000.00	10,000.00	2.00	43.8629	87.73

Funding from Affiliate Company and/or Affiliate Company's Partner without Service Agreement (Details picked up from Exhibit "P-36")

									a	*b*	*c = a*b*
Bank Advice Exhibit No.	**Date**	**Transaction / Ref. No.**	**Remitter Name**	**Beneficiary Name**	**Beneficiary Bank**	**Bank Acct No.**	**Amount (in USD)**		***Rate per transaction (in USD)**	***Conversion Rate**	**Service Income (in PHP)**
							Gross	**Net**			
P-36-1-1196	08/20/2013	CORR13082001327	Ving Go Manpower Co. Ltd.	New York Bay Philippines, Inc.	Banco de Oro Universal Bank	100661166147	20,936.21	20,936.21	2.00	43.8629	87.73
Total							**118,021.46**	**118,021.46**			**938.30**

**Rates per Addenda to Service Agreement: Exh. "P-59-4" - effective Jul. 2011 payments from Middle East =$2.30*
Exh. "P-59-7" - effective Jul. 2013 payments from Middle East =$2.00
**Conversion Rates were based on the rates used by ICPA in its Schedule of zero-rated sales.*

input value-added tax on purchases of goods and services attributable to its zero-rated sales for the four quarters of CY 2013.

SO ORDERED.

ESPERANZA R. FABON-VICTORINO
Associate Justice

We Concur:

LOVELL R. BAUTISTA
Associate Justice

MA. BELEN M. RINGPIS-LIBAN
Associate Justice

ATTESTATION

I attest that the conclusions in the above Decision were reached in consultation before the case was assigned to the writer of the opinion of the Court's Division.

LOVELL R. BAUTISTA
Associate Justice
Chairperson

CERTIFICATION

Pursuant to Section 13 of Article VIII of the Constitution, and the Division Chairperson's Attestation, it is hereby certified that the conclusions in the above Decision were reached in consultation before the case was assigned to the writer of the opinion of the Court's Division.

Juanito C. Castañeda, Jr.
JUANITO C. CASTAÑEDA, JR.
Acting Presiding Justice